Contents

Foreword by The Hon Peter Heerey QC page v
Foreword by Professor George Hay vii
About the authors xxi
Preface xxiii
Acknowledgements xxv
Abbreviations xxix

	luction	

- 1.1 Why focus on anti-cartel law and enforcement? 1
- 1.2 A new anti-cartel regime for Australia background 3
- 1.3 Aims, scope and structure of this book 7

2 The legal framework governing cartel conduct 10

- 2.1 Introduction a complex regime 10
- 2.2 Outline of the statutory regime 10
- 2.3 Coverage of the statutory regime 13
 - 2.3.1 Entity coverage 13
 - 2.3.2 Territorial coverage 14
 - 2.3.3 Temporal coverage 18
- 2.4 The criminal/civil divide 19
 - 2.4.1 Flaws in the dishonesty proposal 19
 - $\begin{array}{ll} 2.4.1.1 & \hbox{A dishonesty element is incapable of limiting a cartel offence to} \\ & \hbox{serious cartel conduct} & \textbf{20} \end{array}$
 - 2.4.1.2 A dishonesty element does not provide a basis for adequately differentiating criminal from civil liability 20
 - 2.4.1.3 The test for dishonesty is uncertain and vulnerable to unmeritorious denials of liability 20
 - 2.4.1.4 A dishonesty element does not accurately label or signal the subject matter of cartel offences 22
 - $\begin{array}{ll} 2.4.1.5 & \text{Questionable precedent for a dishonesty element in a cartel} \\ & \text{offence} & \textbf{23} \end{array}$
 - 2.4.2 Unworkability of suggested alternatives 23
 - 2.4.3 Questionable aspects of the current approach 25
 - 2.4.3.1 Both civil and criminal prohibitions suffer from overreach and uncertainty 25
 - 2.4.3.2 The criminal and civil prohibitions are inadequately distinguished 27
 - 2.4.3.3 Determination of seriousness should not be left substantially to prosecutorial discretion and/or sentencing 28
 - 2.4.3.4 Provision for authorisation is not a sufficient cure for overreach and uncertainty 31

P1: SBT Trim: 247mm × 174mm Top: 10mm Gutter: 22.001mm CUAU096-FM CUAU096/Beaton ISBN: 978 0 521 76089 8

December 2, 2010 12:22

37	CONTENTS
X	CONTENTS

	2.5	2.4.4 A more comprehensive and systematic approach 31 Conclusion 34							
3	Collus	sion (contracts, arrangements, understandings) 36							
	3.1	Introduction – the law in flux on collusion 36							
	3.2	A spectrum of dealings 39							
	3.3	Conceptual boundaries 43							
	3.4	Looking overseas for workable models 47							
		3.4.1 The approach taken in the US and the EU 47							
		3.4.2 Equating 'understanding' with 'concerted practice'? 52							
	3.5	Evidentiary considerations 58							
		3.5.1 Problems with the ACCC's 2007 list of proposed factual matters 59							
		3.5.2 Additional complications 65							
	3.6	Meaning of 'makes' a contract or arrangement, 'arrives at' an							
		understanding or 'gives effect to' a provision 67							
		3.6.1 'Makes' or 'arrives at' 68							
		3.6.2 'Gives effect to' 68							
		3.6.2.1 Purposes of the 'gives effect to' offence and prohibitions 693.6.2.2 Meaning of 'gives effect to' 69	,						
	3.7	Parties to a contract, arrangement or understanding 71							
	3.8	Conclusion – the need for clarity and restraint in defining collusion 73	5						
4	Cartel	nd other provisions 75							
	4.1	Introduction – the pivotal element of a provision 75							
	4.2	Classification of provisions 76							
		4.2.1 Basic economic principles relevant to classification 77							
		4.2.2 The US approach to classification 79							
		4.2.3 The EU approach to classification 83							
	4.0	4.2.4 The Australian approach to classification 86							
	4.3	Price-fixing provisions 89							
		4.3.1 Price-fixing purpose, effect or likely effect 90 4.3.1.1 Purpose 90							
		4.3.1.1 Purpose 90 4.3.1.2 Effect or likely effect 93							
		4.3.2 Fixing, controlling, maintaining or providing for the fixing, controlling	or						
		maintaining of a price, discount, rebate, allowance or credit 95	O1						
		4.3.2.1 Fixing 95							
		4.3.2.2 Maintaining 96							
		4.3.2.3 Controlling 97							
		4.3.2.4 Providing for 99							
		4.3.2.5 Price, discount, rebate, allowance or credit 100							
		4.3.3 Goods or services supplied or acquired, or likely to be supplied or							
		acquired, by the parties to the contract, arrangement or understanding,							
		or re-supplied, or likely to be re-supplied, by persons or classes of person	ns						
		supplied or likely to be supplied by any or all of the parties 100							
	4.4	Exclusionary provisions 102							
		4.4.1 Nature of the exclusionary purpose 104							
		4.4.2 Object(s) of the exclusionary purpose 105							
	4 5	4.4.3 Reform proposals 108							
	4.5	Output restriction provisions 111							
		4.5.1 Output restriction purpose 112 4.5.2 Production, capacity and supply 114							
		1.0.2 Froduction, capacity and suppry							

CONTENTS xi

		4.5.2.1 Production 115
		4.5.2.2 Capacity 116
		4.5.2.3 Supply 116
	4.6	Market allocation provisions 118
		4.6.1 Market allocation purpose 119
		4.6.2 Allocation 120
	4.7	Bid-rigging provisions 121
		4.7.1 Bid-rigging purpose 122
		4.7.2 Joint bidding 125
	4.8	SLC provisions 127
	4.9	Conclusion – the need for reformulation underpinned by a more
		principled and more flexible approach 131
5	Equit o	lements of the cartel offences 135
,	5.1	Introduction – the cartel offences and their physical and
	3.1	fault elements 135
	5.2	Fault elements – a quintessential feature of the cartel offences 137
	3.2	5.2.1 Main fault elements of the cartel offences 137
		5.2.2 Fault concepts 137
		5.2.3 Coverage and application of the fault elements 139
	5.3	Intention 140
	0.0	5.3.1 Intention to make a contract or arrangement or arrive at an
		understanding 140
		5.3.2 Intention to give effect to a cartel provision 142
	5.4	Knowledge or belief that a contract, arrangement or understanding
		contains a cartel provision 142
		5.4.1 The subject matter that must be known or believed 142
		5.4.2 Knowledge 143
		5.4.3 Belief 145
		5.4.4 'Wilful blindness' 147
		5.4.5 Knowledge or belief as to the purpose of the cartel provision
		alleged 150
		5.4.6 Degree of detail of which D must be aware 151
	5.5	Ignorance and mistake of fact or law 152
		5.5.1 Ignorance or mistake of fact 152
	5 (5.5.2 Ignorance or mistake of law 153
	5.6	Fault elements applicable in relation to a 'cartel provision' as
		reformulated in Chapter 4 155
	5.7	Conclusion – the ultimate challenge of formulating workable
		jury directions 156
		5.7.1 The complexity of the cartel offences and the failure to reverse engineer
		their elements on the basis of conceivably workable jury directions 156 5.7.2 Towards model jury directions 157
		5.7.2 Towards inoder jury directions 137

6 Individual liability for cartel conduct 158

- 6.1 Introduction the symbol of jail and illusions of individual accountability 158
- 6.2 Individual liability for cartel conduct as a principal party 159
 - 5.2.1 The basis for individual liability for cartel conduct as a principal party

xii CONTENTS

6.2.2	Individual liabi	lity as a	principal	l party on	the	basis of	personal
	responsibility	160					

- 6.2.2.1 Introduction 160
- 6.2.2.2 Individual liability for cartel conduct as a principal party for allowing or authorising cartel conduct 161
- 6.2.3 Individual liability for cartel conduct as a principal on the basis of vicarious responsibility 165
- 6.3 Individual liability for complicity in cartel conduct 167
 - 6.3.1 The various bases of liability for complicity in cartel conduct 168
 - 6.3.2 Physical elements of individual liability for complicity in cartel conduct on the basis of personal responsibility 169
 - 6.3.2.1 Introduction 169
 - 6.3.2.2 Liability for complicity on the basis of an omission to intervene 170
 - 6.3.2.3 Is liability for complicity in cartel conduct limited by a special requirement of wrongfulness? 173
 - 6.3.3 Fault elements of individual liability for complicity in cartel conduct on the basis of personal responsibility 173
 - 6.3.3.1 Fault elements of liability for aiding, abetting, counselling or procuring 174
 - 6.3.3.2 Fault elements of being knowingly concerned in a cartel offence or contravention 175
 - 6.3.3.3 Fault elements of complicity in relation to the fault elements of the principal offence or contravention 176
 - 6.3.3.4 Fault elements of complicity in relation to the type of principal offence or contravention committed 178
 - 6.3.3.5 Fault elements of complicity in relation to the mode of commission of the principal offence or contravention 179
 - 6.3.3.6 Ignorance or mistake 181
 - 6.3.4 Liability for complicity in cartel conduct on the basis of vicarious responsibility 181
 - 6.3.5 Application of exceptions and defences to liability for complicity 182
 - 6.3.6 Simplifying and otherwise improving the definition of complicity in cartel conduct 182
- 6.4 Individual inchoate liability for cartel conduct attempt, conspiracy, inducement and attempted inducement 184
 - 6.4.1 The thicket of inchoate liability for cartel conduct 184
 - 6.4.2 Double inchoate liability 185
- 6.5 Tacit implication and the problem of the 'shut-eyed sentry' 186
 - 6.5.1 Shut-eyed sentries and the 'insulated conductor' stratagem 186
 - 6.5.2 A difficult challenge 189
- 6.6 Availability of corporate liability and the problem of limited individual accountability for cartel conduct 191
 - 6.6.1 Introduction corporate versus individual accountability 191
 - 6.6.2 Individual accountability for cartel conduct and enforcement discretion 192
 - 6.6.3 Individual accountability for cartel conduct and corporate internal disciplinary systems 195
 - 6.6.4 Individual accountability for cartel conduct, corporate liability and efficiency 198
- 6.7 Sidewinder liability 199
 - 6.7.1 Offences relating to the administration of justice 200

CONTENTS xiii

6.7.1.1	TPA ss 155(5) and 154R(2)	200
---------	---------------------------	-----

- 6.7.1.2 Criminal Code offences 201
- 6.7.1.3 Crimes Act offences 202
- 6.7.1.4 Offences of concealing or compounding a cartel offence 202
- 6.7.2 Money laundering and forfeiture of proceeds of crime 203
 - 6.7.2.1 Money-laundering offences 203
 - 6.7.2.2 Forfeiture orders 204
- 6.7.3 Offences relating to organised crime 205
 - 6.7.3.1 Associating in support of serious organised criminal activity 205
 - 6.7.3.2 Supporting a criminal organisation 205
 - 6.7.3.3 Directing an activity of a criminal organisation 206
- 6.8 Conclusion towards solutions and away from black magic 207

7 Corporate liability 209

- 7.1 Corporate criminal and civil liability under the Australian anti-cartel regime 209
 - 7.1.1 Overview of the TPA provisions relating to corporate liability for cartel conduct 209
 - 7.1.2 Pressure testing the principles and rules relating to corporate liability 212
- 7.2 Policy reasons for having corporate as well as individual criminal and civil liability for cartel conduct 213
 - 7.2.1 Profoundly suspect individualistic conceptions of liability for cartel conduct 213
 - 7.2.2 Inability of methodological individualism to explain corporate action and corporate responsibility 214
 - 7.2.3 Heroic assumptions about the deterrent capability of individual criminal liability 216
 - 7.2.4 Unfounded assumptions about the deterrent incapability of corporate criminal liability 218
 - 7.2.5 Retributive punishment of corporations and corporate fault 218
 - 7.2.6 Corporate criminal liability as a less drastic avenue of deterrence or retribution than individual criminal liability 220
 - 7.2.7 Conclusion as regards the policy of corporate criminal liability for cartel conduct 220
- 7.3 Corporate capacity to be held criminally or civilly liable for cartel conduct 221
 - 7.3.1 Various rules govern corporate capacity to be held liable under Pt IV of the TPA 221
 - 7.3.2 A corporation must be of the type required for corporate liability under the TPA 222
 - 7.3.3 An unincorporated association is not subject to corporate liability under the TPA $\,$ 223
 - 7.3.4 Governmental authorities are subject to liability so far as they carry on a business 224
 - 7.3.5 A corporation is not liable for conduct committed before incorporation or before or after dissolution but a successor corporation may be liable for the conduct of a predecessor corporation 227
- 7.4 Principles governing the attribution of conduct and fault to a corporation 229

xiv CONTENTS

- 7.4.1 Overview of the major issues relating to corporate fault and vicarious responsibility 229
- 7.4.2 Should the general principle of corporate fault under the *Criminal Code* have been excluded from the cartel offences? 229
- 7.4.3 Corporate negligence under s 12.4 of the Criminal Code 232
- 7.4.4 Limiting the application of s 84(1) and (2) to cartel offences where the director, employee or agent acted with intent to benefit the corporation 233
- 7.4.5 A defence of corporate reasonable precautions and due diligence 7.4.5.1 A defence of corporate reasonable precautions and due
 - diligence too easy to establish? 235
 7.4.5.2 A defence of corporate reasonable precautions and due
 - 7.4.5.2 A defence of corporate reasonable precautions and due diligence an insufficient incentive to prevent the commission of cartel offences?
 - 7.4.5.3 A defence of corporate reasonable precautions and due diligence an unjustified departure from the general principle requiring proof of criminal liability beyond a reasonable doubt? 239
- 7.4.6 Can vicarious responsibility be imposed in relation to a subjective fault element by combining the mental states of a number of representatives to create a collective construct of intention, purpose, knowledge or belief? 240
- 7.4.7 To what extent does vicarious responsibility extend to unauthorised conduct? 242
- 7.4.8 Does vicarious responsibility extend to the conduct and fault of a subsidiary corporation? 244
- 7.5 Corporate cartel conduct 246
 - 7.5.1 Looking beyond the humanoid model of cartel conduct under the TPA 246
 - 7.5.2 Corporateness and the concept of a concerted practice under EU competition law 247
 - 7.5.3 Repeated cartel conduct and the concept of the 'whole cartel' 248
 - 7.5.4 Corporate ancillary liability 249
 - 7.5.5 Corporate ratification and reactive disregard of cartel conduct 250
- 7.6 Principles governing the attribution of an exception to a corporation 253
 - 7.6.1 Whose state of mind counts as that of a corporation where an exception requires a state of mind? 253
 - 7.6.2 A solution **255**
- 7.7 Conclusion towards greater recognition of the corporateness of corporate cartel conduct 256

8 Exceptions 259

- 8.1 Introduction the importance of exceptions under the anti-cartel legislation and their current state of disarray 259
- 8.2 Related corporations, dual listed companies and partnerships 262
 - 8.2.1 Related corporations 262
 - 8.2.2 Dual listed companies 264
 - 8.2.3 Partnerships 266
- 8.3 Joint ventures 267
 - 8.3.1 The joint venture exceptions **267**
 - 8.3.2 The joint venture requirement 270

8.4

8.5

8.6

8.7

8.8

8.8.2

314

CONTENTS XV

	8.3.2.1	'Joint venture' 270					
	8.3.2.2 The requirement under ss 44ZZRO and 44ZZRP that the joint						
	venture be 'for the production and/or supply of goods or						
	services' 273						
8.3.3	The requ	irement of a contract or contract proxy 274					
	8.3.3.1	Retrospective application of the contract requirement 275					
	8.3.3.2	Umbrella joint venture contracts 276					
	8.3.3.3	Pre-contractual joint venture arrangements or					
		understandings 279					
	8.3.3.4	Contract proxy requirement that each party have the requisite					
		intention and reasonable belief 280					
	8.3.3.5	The contract requirement is an ineffective response to the					
		problem of sham joint ventures 281					
8.3.4		irement that the cartel provision or exclusionary provision be					
		ourposes of a joint venture' 282					
	8.3.4.1	•					
	8.3.4.2	1 1 3					
	8.3.4.3	1 1 3					
	8.3.4.4	The need or otherwise for a competition test as an element of a					
		joint venture exception 291					
	8.3.4.5	Creating a new exception for collaborative ventures between					
0.0.5		competitors 292					
8.3.5		on as regards the joint venture exceptions 295					
		aining and collective acquisition 296					
8.4.1		re bargaining 296					
8.4.2		re acquisition and joint advertising 298					
		cartel prohibitions with non-cartel prohibitions 299					
8.5.1		overlap exceptions 299 e dealing exceptions 300					
8.5.2 8.5.3							
8.5.4		on of shares or assets exceptions 301 rice maintenance exceptions 302					
		ents between competitors 303					
8.6.1		re of the TPA to exclude economically beneficial or innocuous					
8.0.1		greements between competitors from the operation of the cartel					
	prohibiti						
8.6.2		greements containing a cartel provision that is not covered by					
0.0.2		ption other than authorisation 304					
8.6.3		pply agreements containing a cartel provision that is not covered					
0.0.0		sception other than authorisation 304					
8.6.4		ral supply agreements containing cartel provisions and					
		nary provisions that are not covered by any exception other than					
		ation 307					
8.6.5		c exception for supply agreements between competitors 307					
	ard-settin						
8.7.1		eption under s 51(2)(c) 309					
8.7.2		n issues in standard-setting that have yet to be addressed and					
	how they should be addressed 310						
Intelle		perty 312					
8.8.1		ptions under s 51(3) 312					

The need for and the implications of fundamentally reassessing the relationship between intellectual property rights and cartel prohibitions

xvi CONTENTS

9

8.9	Export	arrangements 316				
	8.9.1	The s 51(2)(g) exception 316				
	8.9.2	Does the s 51(2)(g) exception have a cogent rationale? 317				
8.10	Liner cargo shipping services 318					
		The Pt X exemptions 318				
		Are the Pt X exemptions justified? 320				
8.11		writing arrangements and funding syndicates 321				
8.12		nent of litigation 322				
8.13		risation 324				
0.13		1 Authorisation under s 88 324				
		Conduct preliminary to a grant of authorisation 326 The role of authorisation 327				
014						
8.14		rawal 328				
		Withdrawal under the TPA – navigating the maze 328				
	8.14.2	Withdrawal and criminal or civil liability as a principal for making a				
		contract or arrangement or arriving at an understanding containing a				
		cartel provision or exclusionary provision 329				
	8.14.3	Withdrawal and criminal or civil liability as a principal for giving effect to				
		a cartel provision or exclusionary provision 330				
	8.14.4	Withdrawal and criminal or civil liability for attempting to commit a				
		cartel offence or attempting to contravene a civil prohibition against				
	0.145	cartel conduct 331				
	8.14.5	Withdrawal and criminal or civil liability for complicity in a cartel offence				
	0.146	or breach of a civil prohibition against cartel conduct 331				
	8.14.6	Withdrawal and criminal or civil liability for conspiracy to commit a				
		cartel offence or conspiracy to contravene a civil prohibition against				
	0 1 4 7	cartel conduct 332				
	8.14./	Withdrawal and criminal or civil liability for inducing or attempting to induce the commission of a cartel offence or the contravention of a civil				
	0140	prohibition against cartel conduct 333				
0.15		Conclusion as regards withdrawal 333				
8.15		and reasonable conduct that ought fairly to be excused 333				
8.16		nimis conduct 334				
8.17	Conclu	sion – the need for functional reconstruction 335				
Enforce	ement p	policy 337				
9.1	Introdu	uction – the role of enforcement policy in an anti-cartel				
	regime	2 337				
9.2	_	CCC's Compliance and Enforcement Policy 338				
9.3		CCC-CDPP MOU, ACCC Investigation Guidelines and CDPP				
7.0		ution Policy 341				
	9.3.1	Agency roles 342				
	9.3.2	Decision-making criteria 348				
	7.5.2	9.3.2.1 Investigation 349				
		9.3.2.2 Referral 352				
		9.3.2.3 Prosecution 358				
	9.3.3	Dual proceedings 362				
	7.0.0	9.3.3.1 The statutory protection under s 76B 363				
		9.3.3.2 The meaning of 'substantially the same' conduct 364				
		9.3.3.3 Concurrent versus sequential proceedings 365				
		9.3.3.4 Civil proceedings after criminal proceedings 368				
		9.3.3.5 Criminal proceedings after civil proceedings 371				

CONTENTS xvii

	9.4	Conclusion – the need for policy consolidation and extension 375
10	Immui 10.1	
	10.2	anti-cartel law enforcement 378 Immunity and cooperation policies under a dual civil/criminal regime 380
		10.2.1 Immunity policy 380 10.2.1.1 Immunity from civil proceedings 383 10.2.1.2 Immunity from criminal proceedings 388
		10.2.1.2 Inimitally from Criminal proceedings 366 10.2.2 Cooperation policy 392 10.2.2.1 Cooperation in civil proceedings 394 10.2.2.2 Cooperation in criminal proceedings 398 10.2.2.3 The Canadian approach to cooperation policy 403
	10.3	Immunity and cooperation policies and private enforcement 405 10.3.1 The ACCC's traditional approach to disclosure 407 10.3.2 The 'PCI' scheme 410 10.3.2.1 Section 157C 412 10.3.2.2 Section 157B 414
		10.3.2.2 Section 137B 414 10.3.3 Overseas approaches to disclosure 415 10.3.3.1 US 415 10.3.3.2 EU 417
	10.4	Conclusion – a call for a more coherent and effective approach 419
11	Sanctio	ons 421
	11.1	Introduction – inadequacies and uncertainties in sanctions design and application 421
	11.2	The statutory scheme governing sanctions for cartel conduct 423
	11.3	Civil sanctions 424
		11.3.1 Level of pecuniary penalties against corporations 424
		11.3.2 Influence of ACCC settlements on penalty assessments 433 11.3.2.1 Approach to 'negotiated' penalties 433 11.3.2.2 Impact of 'negotiated' penalties 436
		11.3.3 Approach to penalty assessment 438 11.3.3.1 Base fine 440 11.3.3.2 Adjustments for aggravating and mitigating factors 443 11.3.3.3 Conclusions regarding the approach to penalty
		assessment 445 11.3.4 Penalty maxima based on benefit and turnover 446 11.3.4.1 The benefit maximum 447
		11.3.4.2 The turnover maximum 450 11.3.5 Non-monetary sanctions against corporations 453 11.3.5.1 Alternatives to monetary penalties under the TPA 453 11.3.5.2 Probation orders 455
		11.3.5.3 Community service orders 45711.3.5.4 Information disclosure orders and advertisement orders 45911.3.5.5 Adverse publicity orders 460
		11.3.6 Level of pecuniary penalties against individuals 462

11.3.7 Disqualification orders 464

11.3.7.1 Rationale for disqualification orders 465 11.3.7.2 Length of disqualification orders 466

xviii CONTENTS

11.3.7.3 Effectiveness of disqualification orders 4

- 11.3.8 Ban on indemnification 470
- 11.4 Criminal sanctions 472
 - 11.4.1 State of federal sentencing law 472
 - 11.4.2 Approach to sentencing for cartel offences 473
 - 11.4.3 Sentencing purposes 475
 - 11.4.4 Sentencing principles 478
 - 11.4.4.1 Proportionality 478
 - 11.4.4.2 Totality 481
 - 11.4.4.3 Parity 482
 - 11.4.5 Sentencing factors 483
 - 11.4.5.1 The nature and circumstances of the offence 485
 - 11.4.5.2 Other offences (if any) that are required to be taken into account 487
 - 11.4.5.3 If the offence forms part of a course of conduct consisting of a series of criminal acts of the same or a similar character - that course of conduct 488
 - 11.4.5.4 The personal circumstances of any victim of the offence 488
 - 11.4.5.5 Any loss, injury or damage resulting from the offence 489
 - 11.4.5.6 The degree to which the person has shown contrition for the offence 492
 - 11.4.5.7 If the person has pleaded guilty to the charge in respect of the offence - that fact; and the degree to which the person has cooperated with law enforcement agencies in the investigation of the offence or of other offences 493
 - 11.4.5.8 The deterrent effect that any sentence or order under consideration may have on the person 496
 - 11.4.5.9 The need to ensure that the person is adequately punished for the offence 496
 - 11.4.5.10 The character, antecedents, cultural background, age, means and physical or mental condition of the person 497
 - 11.4.5.11 The prospect of rehabilitation of the person 498
 - 11.4.5.12 The probable effect that any sentence or order under consideration would have on any of the person's family or dependants 498
 - 11.4.5.13 Factors specific to the sentencing of corporations 499
 - 11.4.6 Sentencing options 501
 - 11.4.6.1 General 501
 - 11.4.6.2 Fines 501
 - 11.4.6.3 Imprisonment 505
 - 11.4.6.4 Dismissals, discharges and releases 512
 - 11.4.6.5 State and territory options 514
 - 11.4.6.6 Non-monetary sanctions against corporations under the TPA 515
 - 11.4.6.7 Other TPA options 515
- 11.5 The relationship between private actions and the public enforcement regime 517
 - 11.5.1 Restitution as a condition of immunity 518
 - 11.5.2 Impact of ACCC settlements on private follow-on actions 522
 - 11.5.3 Compensation as a relevant factor in setting penalties 524
- 11.6 Conclusion – the need for greater coherence and certainty 527 11.6.1 Civil sanctions 527

CONTENTS xix

11.6.2	Criminai sa	inctions	529		
11.6.3	The relation	nship bet	ween priva	te actions	and public
	sanctions	532			

12 Compliance and liability control 533

- 12.1 Introduction corporate implications of the anti-cartel legislation for compliance and liability control 533
- 12.2 Compliance and liability control as guides to corporate

internal control 536

- 12.2.1 Compliance 536
- 12.2.2 Liability control 543
- 12.3 Traps set by the anti-cartel legislation 548
 - 12.3.1 Identifying the traps and managing them 548
 - 12.3.2 Giving effect to a cartel or other provision 548
 - 12.3.3 Cartel provisions and other provisions 549
 - 12.3.4 Fault elements of the cartel offences 551
 - 12.3.5 Individual liability 552
 - 12.3.6 Corporate liability 552
 - 12.3.7 Exceptions **554**
 - 12.3.8 Sidewinder liability 555
- 12.4 Opportunities for adroit boundary-riding 556
 - 12.4.1 Identifying the opportunities 556
 - 12.4.2 Commitment to avoid commitment 559
 - 12.4.3 Facilitating practices 560
 - 12.4.4 JV Ultra-Lights 562
 - 12.4.5 Conditions immunised by an intellectual property exception under s 51(3) 563
 - 12.4.6 Insulation of senior managers via the insulated conductor stratagem 563
- 12.5 Conclusion the implications of a liability control framework 564

13 Conclusion 567

- 13.1 Reflecting on the aims of this book 567
- 13.2 Critical assumptions 568
- 13.3 The strengths and weaknesses of the Australian anti-cartel regime 571
 - 13.3.1 A comprehensive framework 571
 - 13.3.2 Multiple objects and matching modes of enforcement 572
 - 13.3.3 Rules reflecting economic seriousness 573
 - 13.3.4 Fault-based liability 574
 - 13.3.5 Rules that are workable 575
 - 13.3.6 Individual accountability 575
 - 13.3.7 Corporate accountability 576
 - 13.3.8 Enforcement policy 577
 - 13.3.9 Immunity and cooperation policy 577
 - 13.3.10 Effective sanctions 578
 - 13.3.11 Compliance and liability control 579
- 13.4 Managing the future of the Australian anti-cartel regime 580

Appendix: Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth) Pt IV Div 1; Pt IV Div 2 s 45 583 Index 601